Author's response to reviews

Title: School difficulties in immigrant adolescent students and roles of socioeconomic factors, unhealthy behaviours, and physical and mental health

Authors:

Kénora Chau (c.kenora@yahoo.fr)
Michèle Baumann (michele.baumann@uni.lu)
Bernard Kabuth (kabuth_b@yahoo.fr)
Nearkasen Chau (Nearkasen.Chau@wanadoo.fr)

Version: 6 Date: 21 May 2012

Author's response to reviews: see over
School difficulties and role of social, material, behavioural, physical and mental resources among multi-cultural students

Kénora Chau, Michèle Baumann, Bernard Kabuth, Nearkasen Chau

Reviewer's report
Title: School difficulties in immigrant adolescent students and roles of socioeconomic factors, unhealthy behaviours, and physical and mental health
Version: 5 Date: 26 April 2012
Reviewer: Lars Lien
Reviewer's report:
Ok
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Many thanks.
Further changes have been made. They are in red colour.
Many thanks for your valuable comments. They allowed improving the manuscript. All changes in the paper are in red colour.

Reviewer's report:

Discretionary Revisions:
NONE

Minor Essential Revisions

Page 5 Material and Methods Paragraph 4-when discussing occupational categories, clarify if these are parent occupations or child.
Yes, “occupational categories” is replaced by “father’s occupational categories”

Page 5 Material and Methods Paragraph 4-what is “inactive”--is that equivalent to unemployed?
Yes, “unemployed and retirees” is added after the term “inactive”. They were grouped because of small number of subjects and their similar risks regarding various school difficulties and also confounders.

Page 5 Material and Methods Paragraph 5-for questions relating to substance use, how did you categorize, did you dichotomize into never versus ever? Be specific
In Table 1, there was one percentage for each substance. This means that use of each substance was dichotomized. But you are right. We need to specify this. So, “(at least once)” is added various Tables and appendix. Furthermore, this sentence is added in the Materiel and Methods section: “These factors were dichotomized (at least once vs. none)”.

Page 6 Material and Methods Paragraph 7-I think your response rate (or at least the people you included in your statistical analyses) was 93.5%
In fact, the participation rate is the percentage of subjects having filled in the questionnaire i.e. 1575/1666 = 94.5%. But we may refer it to 1559 subjects retained for analysis. Your comment led us to change 94.5% to 93.6% (in fact 93.6% and not 93.5%).

Page 8 Discussion Paragraph 3-when discussing "overlaps" do you mean possible interaction or co-linearity between 2 variables In fact, “strong relationships” may be more appropriate. So “overlaps” is replaced by “strong relationships”.

Throughout the paper you refer to first adolescence and second adolescence, you may want to use early and late rather than first and second. I think that "early" and "late" are more commonly used terms Yes, appropriate changes are made.

Table 3-add a row that labels OR and 95% Confidence Interval-similar to table 4 This is no error. Table 4 shows the contributions in the OR in Table 3 of father’s occupation, family structure, WHOQoL-Bref domains and unhealthy behaviours. The ORs in Table 3 are given in Table 3 to state the initial ORs.

Table 4-consider putting a subscript by your columns labeled "%" and then the superscript (b) in the footnote. It will be easier to understand the column and footnote with a superscript. Yes.

There are still a lot of grammatical errors. I have attached a copy with my corrections in red. I would suggest giving a very careful read through, as I am sure I did not catch all of them. Yes. Many thanks for your help.

Major Compulsory Revisions NONE

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.
Declaration of competing interests: I have no competing interest.