Reviewer's report

Title: Body weight dissatisfaction by socio-economic status among obese, preobese and normal weight women and men: Results of the cross-sectional KORA Augsburg S4 population survey

Version: 2 Date: 25 October 2011

Reviewer: Antonio Palmeira

Reviewer's report:

Review for
Body weight dissatisfaction by socio-economic status among obese, preobese and normal weight women and men
Results of the cross-sectional KORA Augsburg S4 population survey
Thomas von Lengerke1,§, Andreas Mielck2; KORA Study Group*

The paper addresses the possible moderation of SES on the association of body image with obesity. This association is an important field of research which have had, as the authors noted, several recent iterations.

The paper is well written, with sound methods and procedures. My recommendation is, therefore, that it should be considered by the editors for publication with minor changes. Notwithstanding, I have some methodological and theoretical questions that which I would like to have a comment by the authors.

I will proceed to the review by the document' sections.

1. Abstract

1.1. Minor essential revisions: Please include more information about the participants. At least age range, % of normal weight, preobese and obese and SES index levels, as these are your main variables.

1.2. Major compulsory revisions. In my opinion you could be more straightforward when presenting the results on the abstract. You refer to “increased odds” but it is not clear what that means - my guess is that they are more dissatisfied with their body weight. But I could not find any information (I could be wrong on this, but I have tried) about why did an increased odds ratio would represent more body weight dissatisfaction in your study (my guess if that you have dichotomized the BWD with 1 - dissatisfied, and 0 - satisfied). If I can make a suggestion your results section of the abstract would be more accurate if you stated something like this: “Among preobese men, compared to the respective lowest socio-economic stratum increased body weight dissatisfaction (or increased odds of being dissatisfied) was associated with the highest index group…”

2. Background
2.1. Minor essential revisions. 1st paragraph. Although you refer to the work of Heidenberg /ref 10), there is another idea that this author have presented elsewhere that could be of interest to your introduction (Heinberg, L. J., Thompson, J. K., & Matzon, J. L. (2001). Body image dissatisfaction as a motivator for healthy lifestyle change: Is some distress beneficial? In R. H Striegel-Moore & L. Smolak (Eds.), Eating disorders: Innovative directions in research and practice. Washington: American Psychological Association). In this book chapter the idea that maybe small amounts of BWD might be motivators for weight loss attempts, but if the level of BWD reaches a certain level it thwarts the motivation.

3. Methods

3.1. Major compulsory revisions. Please include some rationale for the inclusion of smoking and alcohol consumption as covariates (the other health-related behaviors seem more appropriate for the study in question).

3.2. Please comment. Given that you have a large sample I find it difficult to support your decision to dichotomize the BWD variable.

3.3. Please comment. I also find it difficult to support your decision to include in the obese sample all the severity levels. With such a large sample I would suggest that you should remove the severe obese from your sample. I do understand that you state this limitation in your discussion, but it I do believe that the study will be more “critics free” if you contemplate only the 30-35 Kg/m2 sample, or if you sub-divide the obese group in respect to their severity.

4. Results

4.1. Minor essential revisions. Please include on your tables 2 and 3 what does represent the bold OR.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests