Reviewer’s report

Title: Impact of metabolic comorbidity on the association between body mass index and health-related quality of life: a Scotland-wide cross-sectional study of 5,608 participants

Version: 1 Date: 16 January 2012

Reviewer: Lennert Veerman

Reviewer’s report:

This article used data from the Scottish Health Survey to assess the quality of life of persons with obesity without co-morbidity and found that increased BMI was associated with reduced health-related quality of life, which the authors interpret as casting doubt on the notion of “healthy obesity” in a subgroup of obese.

The paper is concise and well-written and draws a clear conclusion that is well-supported by the analysis. I have only very minor comments.

Minor Essential Revisions

Title page: the footnotes indicating position, institution are all numbered 1.

Typo at the end of abstract: please move hyphens to precede full stop.

Table 2: Add r to “never smoke”. Please also use a different symbol for footnote with “sensible drinker”. And correct that definition or move it to “Excessive drinker”: the current version defines it as drinking more than 21 (14) units for men (women).

For clarity, please indicate with Figure 1 that these results were not adjusted for covariates.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.