Author's response to reviews

Title: Impact of metabolic comorbidity on the association between body mass index and health-related quality of life: a Scotland-wide cross-sectional study of 5,608 participants

Authors:

Zia Ul-Haq (Z.ul-haq.2@research.gla.ac.uk)
Daniel F Mackay (daniel.mackay@glasgow.ac.uk)
Elisabeth Fenwick (elisabeth.fenwick@glasgow.ac.uk)
Jill P Pell (jill.pell@glasgow.ac.uk)

Version: 3 Date: 3 February 2012

Author's response to reviews: see over
Dear Editor
BMC Public Health

Re: 1543081922635531
“Impact of metabolic comorbidity on the association between body mass index and health-related quality of life: a Scotland-wide cross-sectional study of 5,608 participants”

Thank you for your email regarding the above mentioned manuscript. We are thankful to your supportive comments and suggestions. We have considered carefully these comments, which have improved the manuscript. We have made the changes as per your suggestions and we are pleased to enclose a revised version of our manuscript. Below are our point by point responses your comments.

1. Because of added sentences, some references at the end of the introduction are now a bit hard to interpret. On top of page 6 it reads: "It is currently unknown whether this association is true...". What does 'this' refer to, exactly? I suggest to replace 'this association' with something of the form 'the association between X and Y'. This will also clarify that 'this question' in the next sentence refers to.
   Response #1
   Point taken and the sentence is rephrased as: (page 5)
   “It is currently unknown whether isolated or “healthy” obesity is associated with the decline in health-related quality of life”.

2. Tables 1 and 2 still define 'sensible drinking' as '> 21 units/week for men, > 14 units /week for women'. That doesn't seem very sensible and it makes me wonder what it takes to qualify as 'excessive drinker.
   Response #2
   Point taken and correction made accordingly.

3. In table 1 the same symbol (*) refers to both 'Chi-square test for trend' and the definition of 'sensible drinker'. Please use different symbols.
   Response #3
   Point taken and correction made accordingly.

And while we are at it, let's be really conscientious:

4. Page 12: "Historically, normal weight was associated with the lowest risk of cardiovascular diseases, type II diabetes and highest health-related quality of life" would be clearer as "Historically, normal weight was associated with the lowest risk of cardiovascular diseases and type II diabetes, and the highest health-related quality of life." But I tread on treacherous ground here: I am not a native English speaker so I am open for alternative formulations.
Response #4  
Point taken and correction made accordingly (page 11).

5. All footnotes indicating position, institution are all still numbered 1 and seem to all refer to the first author.
Response #5  
Point taken and correction made accordingly.