Reviewer's report

**Title:** Comparing HIV prevalence estimates from prevention of mother-to-child HIV transmission programme and the antenatal HIV surveillance in Addis Ababa

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 22 October 2012

**Reviewer:** Jesus M Garcia Calleja

**Reviewer's report:**

I have reviewed the new manuscript and I would like to request two further changes:

1. In the table 2 the number of ANC tested for each year for each site should be added, to provide and insight of the denominator N.

2. The conclusions are too strong based in the evidence presented, it says, therefore we recommend the Addis Ababa City Council Health Bureau and the respective sub-cities to use estimates from PMTCT programme reports for the purpose of HIV surveillance with continuous data quality monitoring using HMIS. This exercise can be used as a pilot to assess the situation on the ground and can guide next steps in formally assessing whether Ethiopia is ready to transition to routine programme based HIV surveillance. Lessons can be learned from Thailand which already changed from antenatal surveillance to PMTCT programme estimates in 2003.

Based in the data and limitations presented (plus other possible issues like HIV testing strategies in the different sites and for different purposes) there is not enough evidence to replace completely such system. In addition the HIV epidemic in Thailand with 95% coverage for ANC services and hospital deliveries are not comparable with Ethiopia. I will suggest to change the wording in something along these lines “taking into account these results Ethiopia should continue to assess PMTCT data in order to replace ANC surveillance.”