Reviewer's report

Title: Alcohol consumption and binge drinking in adolescents: comparison of different migration backgrounds and rural vs. urban residence - a representative study

Version: 1 Date: 4 October 2010

Reviewer: thomas heffernan

Reviewer’s report:

Article Title: Alcohol consumption and binge drinking in adolescents: comparison of different migration backgrounds and rural vs. urban residence – a representative study
Authors: Donath, C., Gräße, E., et al.

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined? Yes it is clearly set out in introduction.
2. Are the methods appropriate and well described? Yes, but unsure as to whether this is part of a previously published study (as intimated on page 7 end of paragraph 1. This needs clarifying).
3. Are the data sound? Yes.
4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition? Yes.
5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data? Yes these are adequately supported by the data presented.
6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated? No – much more needs to be included in the study on limitations, and possibly some areas for future research.
7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished? I think this needs to be more clearly stated (see comment 2 above).
8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found? Yes they are fine.
9. Is the writing acceptable? Yes it is clear and well written.

Decision: Major Compulsory Revisions: 1. Need to clearly state whether the work is part of a previously published data set/study and if so, why the current study needs to be published here as a separate set of data. 2. Also need to include a review of major limitations and some suggestions for future research in the field.

Overall: A well written and informative study. It appears to add something new to the literature, but the authors need to clarify the novelty of the study (has the data been published previously?)
Tom Heffernan

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'