Reviewer's report

Title: Heterosexual Anal Intercourse and HIV Infection Risks in the Context of Alcohol Serving Venues, Cape Town, South Africa

Version: 1 Date: 27 April 2011

Reviewer: Grace Reynolds

Reviewer's report:

This is a well-written manuscript on a timely topic. The research question is well-defined, is based on prior work in the same area, the methods are appropriate and the data are sound, within the limitations noted by the authors. The manuscript adheres to accepted standard for reporting and the conclusions are balanced and supported by the data. The abstract accurately summarizes the research and findings. The modeling approach was very interesting, estimating risks for women from anal intercourse under a variety of scenarios. The recommendation to focus prevention efforts on a constellation of risks rather than focusing exclusively on the small proportion of women practicing anal sex seems appropriate.

Discretionary Revisions
1. Condom use among the sample was high for anal intercourse and condom effectiveness was set at 90%. Sensitivity analysis was conducted to assess parameter estimates if all acts of anal sex were replaced by vaginal sex. On page 11 of the manuscript, the sensitivity analysis is reported to have varied the HIV prevalence and the condom effectiveness parameters (noted to be 90%). Was sensitivity analysis conducted to vary the proportion of anal sex acts that were protected?

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.