Reviewer’s report

Title: Prevalence and correlates of stunting and thinness among Pakistani primary school children

Version: 1 Date: 17 August 2011

Reviewer: Sandra Abreu

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript submitted to the BMC Public Health entitled “Prevalence and correlates of stunting and thinness among Pakistani primary school children” is an interesting one, and it has potential interest for further publication. However, from the point of view of this reviewer, few improvements should be made in order to achieve objectivity and clarity in its underlying message.

This review is presented according to the structure of the article submitted.

• Major Compulsory Revisions

Title

In the title it would be appropriate to include socio-demographic correlates (Prevalence and socio-demographics correlates of stunting and thinness among Pakistani primary school children).

Methods

Design, setting and sample

On page 6 (line 1) it is stated: “Children not willing or unable to participate in the study were excluded”. How do you define unable?

Data collection

On page 6 (lines 1-3) it is stated: “The study instrument was a structured questionnaire, designed in English. It was pre-tested in the survey’s intended population and modified accordingly.” The questionnaire reliability was done?

Results

On page 8 (lines 20-21) it is stated: “Most children (51%) had >3 persons in the living room followed by 1-3 persons (43%) and no person (6%).” What do you mean with no person? Children lived alone?

• Minor Essential Revisions

Methods

Design, setting and sample
On page 5 (lines 3-4) it is stated: “Eighty percent of the population resides in the urban area”. The reference of this sentence is not in accordance with the rules of the BMC Public Health.

Tables
In table 6 (page 30) lack of P value in few variables.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.