Reviewer's report

Title: High Acceptance of Home-Based HIV Counseling and Testing in an Urban Setting in Uganda

Version: 1 Date: 27 June 2011

Reviewer: Damalie Nakanjako

Reviewer's report:

Reviewer's comments
Reviewer: Damalie Nakanjako
Title: High acceptance of home-based HIV counselling and testing in an urban setting in Uganda

General comments: This article addresses an important topic that is relevant to scale up of HIV testing and comprehensive care in high HIV prevalence communities.

Minor essential revisions
1. Abstract
   Background
   Second sentence; ......uptake of HIV testing remains low in Uganda. This statement is not accurate. It is actually coverage of HIV testing that is low whereas uptake is high in the different settings if the HIV test is available and readily offered.

   Objectives: the authors should add that it is HBHCT in an urban community setting and not just an urban setting.

   Methods: The authors need to describe here that acceptance of HBHCT includes consenting and taking the HIV test plus receiving the test results. In the current status, it is not clear whether receipt of the results was considered in the measurement of acceptance yet it is an important step and determines the subsequent benefits of the test result (negative or positive).

   Results: ...30% unknown HIV positive HIV individuals identified .... The authors need to clarify that these were unknown prior to the study; since they were referred after diagnosis during the study.

Body

   Background: Line 10; the authors again talk about low uptake and limited reach of HIV testing services. This should be limited access because once HIV testing is provided, the uptake or acceptability is high in Uganda (Wanyenze R 2007, Nakanjako D 2007).

   Line 14: Some text missing after potential to.....

   Line 18: Rephrase the sentence beginning with HBHCT for clarity
Page 4: line1; facility should be in plural

Line 3: scale up implementation of in Africa. Some text is missing. I suppose it is to scale up of implementation of this HIV testing model.

Page 5: Line 7 and 8. This is to clarify to the authors that these health facilities actually offer provider-initiated HIV testing as part of routine medical care. However there are other VCT sites in Kampala.

Under study setting and population, the authors should describe diameter of the study area (Rubaga) and the mean distance from the participants residence to the nearest testing site. This will present the difference of this setting form the rural settings where patients have to walk long distances to the nearest testing sites.

Line 21: The authors should describe in detail how the random sample of the 5 villages was done. The current description is not reproducible.

Page 6; Under the section on study measurements, the authors need to add that results were delivered to clients

Line 18: Describe briefly how the group counselling was done. This is an attractive model for scaling up HIV testing given the large numbers of people in need of the service in African communities.

Results

The authors need to give a working definition of a household in this study. According to the data presented, it looks like the average family size was 2 or the average number of people tested per family is 2. This could give an underestimation of the prevalence given the high average family size in Uganda.

Page 9; line 15. This sentence should be taken to the discussion section

Line 21 and 22; The authors should mention the specific factors e.g married individuals, age>__years, high education level where associated with.....instead of just mentioning the variable (age, education level, marital status) etc.

The authors should reference the tables in the results section. Currently it is only table 2 that is referred to on page 10.

Discussion:

Line 2: Describe the actual factors and not the variable (as explained above). This should also be applied to the last sentence under the conclusion section.

Last sentence on page 12; which reasons did the patients give for not testing? These are not presented in the results. These are important in order to help the formulation of interventions tailored to this and similar populations.

General questions

Within the family setting, describe how couples were handled in terms of HIV testing and delivery of results including discordant results. Issues of couple counselling, disclosure of results to sexual partner and HIV sero-discordance present major challenges to the scale of HIV testing, prevention and care services. The authors should include these in the methods and results section
where available and in the limitations section if no data is available.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.