Reviewer's report

Title: Modifiable risk factors for overweight and obesity in children and adolescents from Sao Paulo, Brazil

Version: 2 Date: 20 June 2011

Reviewer: Demosthenes Panagiotakos

Reviewer's report:

In their revised manuscript, the authors have adequately responded to my first comments. However, there are some more comments to be addressed

1) Page 6, line 18: The authors should define what they mean by the phrase “The sample was selected to ensure similar numbers of children at each sex and age”. Did they use a stratified sampling scheme or another sampling scheme? If so, was this implemented in their statistical analysis?

2) Page 8, line 1-3: In their response about the reliability and the validity of their questionnaire the authors state that the pilot study was undertaken solely to provide acceptability and feasibility for the main study. Their main exposures (diet/sedentary behavior) are self-reported using the same questionnaire for a large age span (from 7 to 18 years old). Report of physical activity and dietary patterns are suffer from recall and report bias especially in younger ages (7-10 years old). Authors should provide more arguments about their data quality especially in younger ages (< 14 years) with the relevant references. Moreover, in the limitations of the study it should be stated that the questionnaires is only cognitive adaptive and not validated either for the dietary part and the sedentary activity is self reported.

3) Finally I suggest that the prevalence of the children with very low weight should be added in the manuscript because it provides the reader with a full picture of the categorization of the children in Brazil accordingly to their body weight status

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: None
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.