Reviewer's report

Title: "She is not an Indian cultured woman": a cross-sectional study on adolescents' perceptions about smoker in Karnataka, India

Version: 2 Date: 31 May 2011

Reviewer: Nayanatara Nayak

Reviewer's report:

This study can be published as it covers one of the gray areas in tobacco studies and is an additional source of information. It authenticates the general belief that tobacco is socially disapproved in India.

Discretionary Revisions (which are recommendations for improvement but which the author can choose to ignore)

1. However, I find the justification to policy relevance of this study to be limited by the scope of the study. Smoking as compared to chewing tobacco is lesser among adolescents and is less than 1% among girls in the state and almost absent in rural and semi urban areas. So an analysis of the perceptions on overall tobacco use rather than just smoking would have been useful.

2. The title is meaningful, but seems to be biased as it gives an impression that the study reflects the perceptions of adolescents only on female smokers (who are very few as compared to male smokers).

3. In discussion part under limitations, it may be said that the findings may be generalized to the relevant population in Bengaluru district and not to other urban areas of the state as I feel that Bengaluru represents metropolitan culture and the influence of different population groups is higher on the young. It is not representative of other urban areas of the state.

4. What does the initial sample size of 575 indicate? This can be made clear.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. In section on results under the title “Perceptions of male and female smokers based on gender of students” please look into construction of sentences and minor corrections like on an average, etc.

2. There is a need for proper alignment of paragraphs, titles and footnote to table. I think this is because of conversion to PDF version.

3. In section on results under the title “Perceptions of male and female smokers based on gender of students”, the description of Fig-1 says that “more male students represented by solid line”.................But, in Fig 1 the solid line(i.e.
straight line without dots) is shown in the legend as perceptions of female adolescents. Please check.

Major Compulsory Revisions (which the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

There are no major compulsory revisions needed. I hope minor essential revisions would be looked into.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'