Reviewer’s report

Title: Higher body mass index may advance asthma among adolescents with pre-asthmatic symptoms: a prospective cohort study

Version: 1 Date: 8 February 2011

Reviewer: Haleh Sadrzadeh-yeganeh

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript titled "Higher body mass index may advance asthma among adolescents with pre-asthmatic symptoms: a prospective cohort study" provides useful data but certain clarifications need to be made.

Minor Essentional Revisions:

-In the title, "high body mass index may advance asthma …" implies that high BMI may increase the severity of an existing asthma. The paper, however, suggests that high BMI may induce asthma.

-Abstract; it must be emphasized that the odd ratios presented in the results are for the girls only.

-Methods, under "study design"; explain how samples were selected for the present study from the larger cohort? Was it random?

-Methods; abbreviations PEF, ATS need to be explained when introduced in the text for the first time.

-Methods, under "other risk factors for asthma"; clarify whether the cut-off values of BMI are based on a nationwide study or on a specific one.

-Methods, under "other risk factors for asthma"; it is not clear whether a validated questionnaire was used for assessing exercise frequency. If it was not, mention on what basis the level of exercise was assessed.

-Results, second paragraph; specify the "significant differences between genders…" refers to which table.

-Results, third paragraph; very briefly explain the significance of the results in Table 3.

-Discussion, first paragraph; the first three sentences on "prevalence and incidence …" are ambiguous. Sentences need to be rewritten.

-Discussion, the last sentence of the first paragraph is incomplete.

-Discussion, forth paragraph, fifth line; initials of first names should be omitted from the text.
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.