Reviewer's report

Title: Intra-familial and ethnic effects on attitudinal and perceptual body image of South African women

Version: 1 Date: 13 February 2011

Reviewer: Miranda Pallan

Reviewer's report:

This paper focuses body image and body dissatisfaction in South African women and their daughters, and explores the intra-familial and ethnic influences on body image. This is discussed within the context of obesity.

This is, in general, a very well presented paper that addresses a particular psychosocial aspect of obesity, and is novel in that it particularly explores the influence of mother's body image on their daughters.

I do however have some major compulsory revisions that would make this paper clearer for readers, these are listed below.

Title:
1. The title refers to intra-familial and ethnic effects of body image on South African women. The interest of this study is that it looks at mother and daughter diads, so I would suggest the title is changed to better reflect this.

Methods:
2. Under the study population section the authors describe the mother-daughter diads that were included in the sample. It is not clear who were excluded. From what is written, it looks like mothers and daughters of different ethnicities were excluded. If this is the case, this should be made clearer, and some justification for this exclusion should be given.

3. A little more detail should be given on the silhouettes used to measure body image; how exactly was the instrument administered to the mothers and daughters; does each silhouette correspond to an actual BMI value or BMI? A psychometric evaluation of the instrument should also be given.

4. Authors state that the "Feel" silhouettes were compared to WHO BMI percentiles for girls. Please give a reference for these percentiles.

5. A little more detail needs to be included in the methods on how BMI and body fat data were collected, i.e. how the measurements were undertaken on the mothers and daughters.

Results:
6. In general, clearly presented. Table 2a is somewhat confusing, this information may be better presented in two tables; one showing the unadjusted
mother and daughter scores, and the other showing the mother and daughter scores adjusted for maternal BMI.

Discussion:
7. The last sentence of the discussion, prior to the conclusions, states:
"These results have important implications on the development of obesity in South Africa following the high prevalence of obesity in women, which also differs between ethnic groups."
I think this needs to be expanded on, so that the authors state what these implications are.

Conclusions:
8. The authors briefly indicate that their findings should be considered by professionals who are developing and delivering obesity interventions. The paper would benefit from a more detailed discussion around the implications of the findings with respect to obesity prevention and management in both adults and children.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
I declare that I have no competing interests.