Reviewer's report

Title: An association between seeing incidents of alcohol or drug use in films and young Scottish adults’ own alcohol or drug use: cross sectional study

Version: 2 Date: 3 January 2011

Reviewer: Dirk Baier

Reviewer's report:

The revision has improved the quality of the paper a lot. There are only two points I would like the authors to think about and that may be part of a last revision (Discretionary Revisions):

1. Control variables: Maybe the authors should say in text that no other control variables then the ones they use are available. As a reader I still wonder why they control for time of media use (I don’t know any study that found an association between media time and drug use) but not for migration background, religiosity or leisure time activities.

2. Linear Trends: The authors point out that their analyses find significant linear trends. Looking at the OR in table 3, model (a) there are at least for “heavy drinking” and “binge drinking” no linear trends. Only quartile 4 differs significantly from the other quartiles, and only because of this difference, tests of linearity become significant, I would guess. Maybe the authors should be more cautious with saying that there are linear trends. And maybe they should discuss briefly, why only this quartile and not for instance quartile 2 and 3 differs significantly in their alcohol consumption. So, why only watching a lot of alcohol in the media is associated with own alcohol consumption?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.