Reviewer's report

Title: Using population attributable risk to choose HIV prevention strategies in gay men

Version: 1 Date: 22 November 2010

Reviewer: Ronny Heikki Tikkanen

Reviewer's report:

The topic of the paper is very interesting and highly relevant for HIV prevention. As stated by the authors, the paper is unique in its analysis. Moreover, it is providing important information for future HIV preventive interventions.

The paper is very well written and is clear in the focus. The title is relevant and the abstract includes all the information that is needed in order to understand the whole paper. The research questions posed by the researchers are highly relevant and well defined. The data is sound and the data collection is described in other published and revised articles – which makes the data collection and the data used credible. The paper is structured in a relevant way and follows the standard used in academic papers. The discussion and the conclusions made are backed up by the findings. There is a comprehensive discussion about the limitations of the study. The authors relate to relevant studies in their arguments and analysis.

Discretionary Revisions: I would suggest a clearer description of the PAR. It is difficult for someone who is not familiar with PAR to fully understand the tables and the analysis. The articles would also benefit from a clearer presentation of why certain risk factors such as “anal warts” and “circumcision” are included in the analysis. Not all readers might be familiar with these aspects of HIV risk taking.

In table 1 the person-time (within brackets) is not explained to the reader.

Minor Essential Revisions: None

Major Compulsory Revisions: None

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests