Author's response to reviews


Authors:

Braimoh Bello (bbello@rhru.co.za)
Olufolawajimi Fadahun (folajimi1@yahoo.co.uk)
Danuta Kielkowski (danuta.kielkowski@nioh.nhls.ac.za)
Gill Nelson (gill.nelson@nioh.nhls.ac.za)

Version: 3 Date: 24 January 2011

Author's response to reviews: see over
January 23, 2011

THE EDITOR
BMC SERIES JOURNALS

Dear Dr. Silvano Gallus,


Thank you for your interest in publishing our article in your reputable journal. We received excellent comments from the reviewers.

We have made all requested corrections. We include the revised manuscript and one with tracked changes in this submission. We included in this cover letter (below) our response to the reviewers, and a point-by-point description of the changes made.

We are confident that you will find the paper publishable in its recent version. We look forward to a favorable consideration of the revised article.

Yours truly,

Braimoh Bello

RHRU, University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa

Tel: +27-11-3585501 Email: bbello@rhru.co.za
Reviewer's report


Version: 2 Date: 21 December 2010

Reviewer: NABIHA MISSAOUI

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions

1) All abbreviation should be defined first time of use: such as US, UK, HIV/AIDS...

These corrections have been made

2) "Declining trends in lung cancer mortality rates in men and increasing trends in women have also been reported in Europe and America. [10 – 13, 15 – 17, 21 – 23]." should be "Declining trends in lung cancer mortality rates in men and increasing trends in women have also been reported in Europe and America [10 – 13, 15 – 17, 21 – 23]."

This has been corrected

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests

Thank you for the review.
Reviewer's report
Version: 2 Date: 20 December 2010
Reviewer: cristina bosetti

Reviewer's report:
Minor Essential Revisions
The author can be trusted to make these. For example, missing labels on figures, the wrong use of a term, spelling mistakes.

Thank you. These have been corrected.

The paper can be accepted after addressing the following points.

Major points
I would standardize the rates according to the world standard population, in order to compare them with other data.

The rates have been standardized using the world standard population as requested.

Minor points
Abstract
In the results, provide also the rates overall, in men and in women (see Results section).

These rates have been added to the abstract.

Background
Modify the sentence “In 2003, the South African Medical Research Council published burden of disease estimates listed cancer as the fourth leading cause of death and the eighth major contributor to disability adjusted life years (DALYs) in the country” as “In 2003, the South African Medical Research Council published burden of disease estimates, and listed cancer as the fourth leading cause of death and the eighth major contributor to disability adjusted life years (DALYs) in the country”.

Modify the sentence “Recent changes in smoking prevalence and patterns have produced changes in lung cancer incidence worldwide. While there has been a substantial decline in lung cancer incidence rates in developed countries, such as the USA, Canada and many parts of Europe [10–13]” as “Recent changes in smoking prevalence have produced changes in lung cancer incidence and mortality worldwide. While there has been a substantial decline in male lung cancer rates in developed countries, such as the USA, Canada and many parts of Europe [10–13]”

These sentences have been modified

Reviewer's report
Version: 2 Date: 20 December 2010
Reviewer: cristina bosetti

Reviewer's report:
Minor Essential Revisions
The author can be trusted to make these. For example, missing labels on figures, the wrong use of a term, spelling mistakes.

Thank you. These have been corrected.

The paper can be accepted after addressing the following points.

Major points
I would standardize the rates according to the world standard population, in order to compare them with other data.

The rates have been standardized using the world standard population as requested.

Minor points
Abstract
In the results, provide also the rates overall, in men and in women (see Results section).

These rates have been added to the abstract.

Background
Modify the sentence “In 2003, the South African Medical Research Council published burden of disease estimates listed cancer as the fourth leading cause of death and the eighth major contributor to disability adjusted life years (DALYs) in the country” as “In 2003, the South African Medical Research Council published burden of disease estimates, and listed cancer as the fourth leading cause of death and the eighth major contributor to disability adjusted life years (DALYs) in the country”.

Modify the sentence “Recent changes in smoking prevalence and patterns have produced changes in lung cancer incidence worldwide. While there has been a substantial decline in lung cancer incidence rates in developed countries, such as the USA, Canada and many parts of Europe [10–13]” as “Recent changes in smoking prevalence have produced changes in lung cancer incidence and mortality worldwide. While there has been a substantial decline in male lung cancer rates in developed countries, such as the USA, Canada and many parts of Europe [10–13]”

These sentences have been modified
Conclusion
Modify the sentence “The trends in lung cancer mortality in South Africa are similar to those in other countries.” as “The trends in lung cancer mortality in South Africa are similar to those in developed countries.”

This has been done.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.
Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests

Thank you for the review.