Reviewer’s report

Title: Predictors of weight change from before pregnancy to one year postpartum.

Version: 1 Date: 16 October 2010

Reviewer: Anjel Vahratian

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:
1. It is unclear how this analysis contributes something new to the literature. Please address this issue in both your introduction and discussion.
2. Please clarify how this study population was identified. The authors mention that the Municipal Health Services of Amsterdam aims to register every pregnant woman. Is this a national system to enroll pregnant women into prenatal care or is this different, such as a national birth registry - and if so, this is done at the time of pregnancy vs. pregnancy outcome? How were participants ‘invited’? Did the authors consider more than one initial mailing to identify the final study population? This is unclear as an exclusion point was ‘when one or more follow-up questionnaires were missing.’
3. While this is advertised as a longitudinal study, a significant proportion of the data was collected retrospectively and the analyses performed were cross-sectional. It is unclear why the authors did not utilize the repeated measures taken in their analysis plan. It is unclear how the repeated measures were incorporated in the analysis. Further clarification is needed about which time points were used in the analyses. When the authors discuss their results, they need to be specific about what time point they are referring to.

Minor Essential Revisions:
1. Please clarify the comment re: ‘insufficiently reliable questions’ for sendentary behavior on page 10.
2. Why were the authors focused on breastfeeding at 4 months? Why was this selected as a cutpoint?
3. What cutpoints were used to assess pre-pregnancy BMI? WHO? IOM? Classification of overweight and obesity was never defined in the paper.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.