Reviewer's report

Title: Maternal and Neonatal Health Expenditure in Mumbai Slums (India): A Cross Sectional Study

Version: 2 Date: 20 December 2010

Reviewer: Priyanka Saksena

Reviewer's report:

General comments:

The revised manuscript is clearer in many sections and as such improved. It should provide useful guidance to Indian policy makers as well as other researchers.

Revisions:

The only major concern remains the use of the imputation as the authors have chosen to retain the technique in the paper. I am not able to find the Flores 2008 paper which the authors refer to in their response letter with regards to imputation statistics. In general, I think a review by a statistician on the use of imputation in this context may be useful. But I would leave the editorial committee to decide if that they think this is necessary.

One other thing to note is that given that previous literature has documented that aggregate expenditures and total expenditures often give very different estimates of OOP (Lu et al, Bulletin of WHO, 2009 & Xu et al, Health Policy, 2009) it may be worth discussing potential biases in the results and/or discussion section.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.