Reviewer's report

Title: Effectiveness of intensive group and individual interventions for smoking cessation in primary health care settings. A randomized trial.

Version: 7 Date: 18 November 2009

Reviewer: Cristina Masuet

Reviewer's report:

On my opinion the paper has improved after different comments, adding the current guidelines criteria (CONSORT) to present a Clinical trial. Nevertheless the main methodologically limitations are difficult to modify, because the main objection is the limited number of patients included into the study (287 instead of 597), and afterwards a high number of population that was lost during the follow-up period (208 of 287).

This is why I consider a Rejection of the paper.

Nevertheless I would like to present basically some issues:

a) Sample size has been correctly explained in the discussion section but it is still fundamental to know the potency of the study because of the huge anormalities produced since the recruitment until the end of follow-up of the population. In fact from 597 estimated as a needed sample you allocate only 287, and lost 208

b) High number of missing data in the follow-up period, recruitment and inclusion patient rates had been explained. Nevertheless I consider that the continuous abstinence rate should be the main variable instead of point abstinence rates. And on the other hand authors should discuss the need to create a multivariate analysis of 79 patients of 597 estimated, and 287 recruited.

c) Explain in the discussion section how pharmacological therapies could modify main conclusions, as it is only estimated by multivariate analysis of 79 patients.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Correct

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.