Author's response to reviews

Title: Could giardiasis be a risk factor for low zinc status in schoolchildren from northwestern Mexico? A cross-sectional study with longitudinal follow-up

Authors:

Luis Quihui-Cota (lquihui@ciad.mx)
Gloria G Morales-Figueroa (lmorales@ciad.mx)
Rosa O Mendez-Estrada (romendez@ciad.mx)
Johanna G Leyva-Perez (Johanna_ Leyva@hotmail.com)
Julian Esparza-Romero (jullian@ciad.mx)
Mauro E Valencia-Juillerat (Mauro@ciad.mx)

Version: 5 Date: 1 February 2010

Author's response to reviews: see over
Could giardiasis be a risk factor for low zinc status in schoolchildren from northwestern Mexico? A cross-sectional study with longitudinal follow-up.

Luis Quihui-Cota, Gloria G Morales-Figueroa, Johanna G Leyva-Perez, Mauro E Valencia-Juillerat, Julian Esparza-Romero and Rosa O Mendez-Estrada

Dear Dr Quihui-Cota

However, before acceptance, we would urge you to further improve the manuscript in response to the amendments our Associate Editor has made to your manuscript file (please see attached).

1 Suggestion: Removing of the word “rates” from the “Background” section
Answer: The word “rates” has been removed from the line 3 in the “Background” section.

2 Suggestion: “Please provide in this paragraph the reason why some kids were not measured”
Answer: The reason requested was provided from lines 1 to 3 in the subsection “Anthropometry” in the section “Methods”

3 Suggestion: “Please provide the exact p-value as for the other variables”
Answer: The p values for the statistical comparison (chi-square) economic variables “working mothers and fathers” and “completed secondary school by mothers and fathers” were provided from lines 18 to 20 in the “Results” section

4 Suggestion: Even though the increase was not as sticking as in the control group, there was clearly a tendency for an increase and this should not be ignored. It may be due to a subtle increase in zinc intake due to a raised awareness of the issue in mothers. This should be mentioned in the discussion and the results here should mention that there was a tendency for an increase, even though not strictly significant.
Answer: The finding about the no significant increase of the serum zinc level in the Giardia free group is explained from line 32 to 33 in the “Results” section and lines 32 to 36 in the “Discussion” as suggested. In the same way, the concern issue about the dietary intake is discussed from lines 50 to 54 in the “Discussion” section.

5 There were small changes that we decided to do because our own decision or small mistakes that we found during the revision of the manuscript without changing any meaning at all. They are as follows:
1 It was a change in the appearing order of the authors Johanna G. Leyva-Perez, Mauro Eduardo Valencia Juillerat and Rosa Olivia Mendez Estrada.
2 There was a change of redaction from lines 34 to 41 respecting the meaning of the original paragraph in the “Results” section.
3 There was a change of redaction from lines 53 to 57 respecting the meaning of the original paragraph in the “Discussion” section.