Reviewer’s report

Title: Socio-cultural determinants of adiposity and physical activity in preschool children: a cross-sectional study

Version: 1 Date: 24 July 2010

Reviewer: Stuart Biddle

Reviewer’s report:

General Comments and Major Compulsory Revisions

1. This paper reports data on adiposity, physical activity, sedentary behaviour and ‘motor skills’ in young children differing by socio-cultural factors. Significant differences are found.
2. The paper is interesting and novel in reporting on children from the same country but differing by region and language.
3. More needs to be said on why such differences are occurring, beyond ‘socio-cultural’ differences. What specifically might explain such differences?

Specific Comments

P6: apart from language, how do these samples differ?
P6, end of para 1: give percentage (for n=485)
P7, para 2, L (line) 1: repetition
P7, para 3, L2: best to avoid use of the word ‘inactivity’ when referring to ‘sedentary behaviour’.
P7, para 3; how do your counts for sedentary behaviour compare with those recommended by Reilly with pre-school children?
P7: I don’t think this is really a test of ‘motor skills’; it is more a test of ‘agility’. This raises the issue of why you are assessing this. What is the justification?
P8, para 2: why are you assessing migrant status? All aspects of assessment require justification in the Introduction. This also applies to time outside and TV viewing.
P10, para 2, L3: avoid the word ‘inactivity’. You are assessing ‘total sedentary time’ and TV viewing – two different constructs.
P15, para 2, L4: why and how might social networks play a role?
P16, para 2, L1: I would like to see more on how the ‘broader social environment’ influences the key variables of interest. This is central to your study.
P23: ref 38 has detail missing.

Stuart Biddle
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests