Reviewer’s report

Title: Physician's manual reporting underestimates mortality: evidence from a population-based HIV/AIDS treatment program

Version: 1 Date: 1 July 2010

Reviewer: Marco AA Vitoria

Reviewer’s report:

The overall quality of the manuscript seems very good, with clear description of the objectives of the study, adequate methodology and balanced conclusions, which was well supported by the collected data. The strengthens and weaknesses of the study were clearly stated and the proposed paper shown a good writing style.

However, despite the Authors have informed that they cannot compare the differences between the number of HIV deaths reported by physicians according with patient ethnicity, the discussion session of the manuscript could be further improved if the authors expand the specific paragraph on this topic. Despite some studies found disagreement between physician and vital statistic reporting of deaths, it is important to comment that some confounders as socio-economic status can be present. Furthermore, the relevance of this specific issue is probably limited in the context of RLS. My suggestion is to explore this subject a little more in the discussion session.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.