Reviewer's report

Title: An exploratory study on Muslim adolescents' views on sexuality. Implications for sex education and prevention.

Version: 4 Date: 6 July 2010

Reviewer: Keith Horvath

Reviewer's report:

I thank the authors for their thoughtful consideration of the suggested edits to the manuscript, "Muslim adolescents and their views on sexuality. Using Internet forums as a means of qualitative research." The manuscript is improved from the prior submission. However, there are 3 outstanding issues that I believe are important to address:

1) From my prior review, I noted that the results may have limited public health relevance because the results confirm findings from existing studies and because of the data source (online bulletin boards). In response, the authors stated that, "we used a study population that has to date not been used to examine Muslim adolescents' ideas about sexuality and thus provides an important replication of previous findings in a different sampling population." Although I agree that it appears that the sample was recruited from a different venue than samples of Muslim adolescents from prior studies, the fact that few demographics (outside of approximate age, religious identification, and gender) were reported leaves it an open question as to whether this is a different population from other studies or not. Given how little is known about participants in this study, it is unclear to me whether this is a legitimate argument to justify the importance of the results.

2. In my prior review, I note that the recommendation of involving parents in the development and implementation of comprehensive sex education does not seem compatible with the world view expressed by Muslim adolescents in the study. In their response, the authors state, "We do like to point out that the involvement of parents in the intervention was not meant as a recommendation for practice but rather as an illustration that such interventions are likely to run into difficulties." This confuses me since the first submission and the latest version state, "Given the general difficulties with involving parents in sexuality education..., the lack of parent-child communication about sexuality among Muslims..., and the negative views of Muslim parents on school based sexuality education..., ONE POSSIBLE WAY OUT SEEMS TO ACTIVELY INVOLVE PARENTS IN THE PROCESS OF DEVELOPMENT, IMPLEMENTATION, AND MONITORING OF SCHOOL-BASED SEXUALITY EDUCATION..." and further "Since in Islam sexuality education is segregated..., BOTH FATHERS AND MOTHERS SHOULD BE INVOLVED." The items I've capitalized above read unambiguously as recommendations for practice. Please clarify.

3. In this version of the manuscript, the authors described more clearly what the
novel finding of the study was, namely, "We observed that some of our participants actually denounced an Imam as unknowledgeable when the Imam contradicted the participant's worldview." It would be helpful to extend this discussion to clearly indicate whether this would benefit or impede sexuality education for Muslim adolescents.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests