Reviewer's report

Title: A qualitative analysis of immigrant population health practices in the Girona Healthcare Region

Version: 2 Date: 24 April 2010

Reviewer: Kenny Kwong

Reviewer's report:

I want to commend the authors who addressed most of the questions I raised in the original manuscript. I just have a few minor issues that need to be addressed by authors as described below:

Minor Essential Revisions

1. The authors indicated that cultural mediators (page 4) in addition to medical staff and nurses who were responsible for choosing the participants. Please clarify who these cultural mediators were and what their roles in general in your healthcare system.

2. On page 4, I am still unclear about the composition of participants (nineteen participants were selected (6 Moroccan women, 7 sub-Saharan women – Gambian – and 6 men, 2 natives, 2 from Morocco and 2 from Gambia). Please clarify the distribution of participant characteristics again based on their gender and the regions they are coming from. Please clarify if they actually participated in the study and not just they were “selected” to participate.

3. Include the information on the number of participants (both patients and providers) and the number of discussion groups and interviews in the abstract (page 2).

4. Appendix II provided a list of broad topics covered in in-depth interviews rather than interview questions. To address this concern, the authors can either provide a list of interview questions similar to Appendix 1 or delete Appendix II and indicated these broad topics for in-depth interviews as part of the narrative on page 5 under Data gathering techniques. It is necessary to make reference to these appendices in your narrative (page5).

5. The authors mentioned that “the only limitations for participating (other than the categorisation criteria) were that subjects had not participated in the quantitative phase of the project and that women were mothers.” Please clarify why you think it’s a limitation. This appears to me more as the specific inclusion and exclusion criteria rather than limitations and it will be helpful that you provide brief rationales of using these criteria for your selection of participants.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.