Reviewer’s report

Title: Home-based voluntary HIV counselling and testing highly acceptable and equitable

Version: 1 Date: 14 June 2009

Reviewer: Miriam Sabin

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript describes an important area in regard to HIV testing and counseling, that is, the inequity in distribution between urban versus rural access to HIV testing and counseling. However, while the authors make this conclusion in the discussion section, the methodology and subsequent data analysis are not appropriate for the paper's focus. If two major areas could be addressed, this paper would surely provide an important area of contribution to this area of inquiry.

Major compulsory revisions:
- Essentially, the logistic regression is not necessary nor is it appropriate in design. One does not need to perform logistic regression to examine pre versus post test associations. Given the important and noteworthy focus in the discussion on rural versus urban HIV testing and counseling access, if one were to perform logistic regression, this should be the focus. For example, one could examine the association between receiving one’s results versus not receiving one’s results. In unassociated chi square analyses, the issue of rural versus urban would most likely be significant; in logistic regression, rural versus urban could be examined when adjusted for other factors. If rural proved to be strongly associated with not receiving results, this would be a far stronger contribution to the literature. Results presented in the first paragraph suggest that "close to 80% of those expressing willingness to be tested were actually counselled, tested and provided with the test result", which does not appear in the data presented in the abstract or in the results section from what I can determine. Either this result is incorrect or it should be presented in a clearer fashion.

- Discretionary revisions: review paper for grammatical errors.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.