Reviewer’s report

Title: Vitamin D supplementation and hip fracture risk. A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised controlled trials and observational studies

Version: 1 Date: 25 March 2010

Reviewer: Francesca Bravi

Reviewer’s report:

The authors have conducted a meta-analysis of published articles on the role of vitamin D and parathyroid hormone on hip fracture risk. The manuscript is clearly written and data are adequately analysed. I have only some minor suggestions.

Minor Essential Revisions

1) In the Materials and methods, page 6, the authors stated that they used a logarithmic transformation with geometric mean and standard error estimated using asymptotic Taylor series approximation. It would be advisable to explain why this choice was necessary.

2) Please check and correct totals in figure 2.

Discretionary Revisions

1) Inclusion and exclusion criteria may be described in the Materials and Methods, avoiding the use of bullet lists.

2) I suggest to show in tables 1-3 the mean age of the subjects in each study (when available); this would be a useful information on the populations under investigation.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests