Reviewer's report

Title: Incidence and mortality of hip fracture among Korean elderly: a population-based study using the National Health Insurance Claims data

Version: 1 Date: 22 November 2009

Reviewer: Robyn Norton

Reviewer's report:

This paper presents data from the Korean National Health Insurance claims database; it describes the incidence and mortality associated with hip fracture among older Koreans, and identifies factors that are associated with post-fracture mortality. Given that such data have not previously been described, this paper provides new information that has the potential to guide local decisions about strategies for hip fracture prevention in Korea as well as contribute to global knowledge about both hip fracture incidence and factors associated with post-fracture mortality.

Comment 1 (minor essential revision): it is not clear whether these findings include data from both North and South Korea – if only the latter, this should be clearly identified and reflected in the title and throughout the paper.

The methods have been appropriately described and the results are clearly outlined. The discussion then compares the key findings with those from other studies and additionally considers the findings regarding potential risk factors for post-fracture mortality and the implications of these findings for future prevention strategies within South Korea. Overall the discussion is logically organised and is reasonably comprehensive in its approach.

Comment 2 (discretionary revisions): The paper would have been enhanced by a more detailed comparison of the incidence and mortality rates with rates from other countries. Currently the incidence rate comparisons are only made with earlier studies undertaken in Korea and the international comparisons that are presented refer only to males. The mortality rate comparisons refer only to three discrete studies undertaken in the US, Greece and Sweden.

The conclusions are somewhat bland, but in essence highlight the fact that hip fracture prevention and management in South Korea is worthy of attention if both the incidence and in particular related mortality are to be reduced.

In summary, this paper has been well written and provides a useful understanding of the current situation with regard to hip fracture in Korea.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests