Reviewer's report

Title: Repeal of the Pennsylvania Motorcycle Helmet Law: Reflections on the Ethical and Political Dynamics of Public Health Reform

Version: 1 Date: 7 February 2010

Reviewer: James Mayrose

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

Although this manuscript is well written and informative, it lacks the scientific rigor necessary for publication in a peer reviewed scientific journal. I would suggest publishing as an editorial rather than a scientific paper.

Discretionary Revisions

The discussion could be strengthened with the addition of helmet use and fatality data from other states that have also repealed motorcycle helmet laws. The data presented does not tell the whole story and in some cases (Louisiana and Kentucky) data is not given. The inclusion of the following data, before and after the change in state law, would also strengthen the manuscript: the number of motorcycle registrations, vehicle miles traveled, number of fatalities, as well as age and sex of riders.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests