Reviewer’s report

Title: The psychometric properties of three self-report screening instruments for identifying frail older people in the community

Version: 2 Date: 1 February 2010

Reviewer: Lisa Lix

Reviewer’s report:

Minor Essential Revisions

- Page 5: the word "various" is repeated in the sentence that begins: "During the last decades, various instruments..." Please revise this sentence to address this repetition.

- Page 10: the explanation of the Kuder-Richardson Formula 20 is not correct. The following wording is suggested: "Cronbach's alpha coefficient was calculated to evaluate internal consistency of items. Cronbach’s alpha will produce the same result as the Kuder-Richardson Formula 20 (K-R-20), which can be used to assess internal consistency for dichotomous items."

- Page 11: The authors should provide a reference(s) for the Mann-Whitney U and Kruskal-Wallis tests. Also, the authors should make it clear that both statistical procedures are used to test hypotheses about equality of distributions rather than equality of population means. The authors should explain why these statistical procedures were chosen instead of independent sample t-tests or analysis of variance (ANOVA).

- Discussion, page 15: It is not clear why "longitudinal study designs are needed to obtain a better view on relevant cut-off points for frailty..." The authors should clarify this point.

- Table 3: There appears to be an error in the reported values of the Mann-Whitney U test statistics. The test statistic is approximately normally distributed in large samples. Therefore, the authors should be reporting a z-statistic. The very large reported values are illogical (particularly for the GFI and SPQ where p = .001).

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.