Reviewer’s report

Title: Effects of De-industrialization on Unemployment, Re-employment, and Work Conditions in a Manufacturing Workforce

Authors:

Aleck S Ostry (ostry@interchange.ubc.ca)
Ruth Hershler (hershler@interchange.ubc.ca)
Shona Kelly (shona.kelly@ubc.ca)
Paul Demers (paul.demers@ubc.ca)
Kay Teschke (kay.teschke@ubc.ca)
Clyde Hertzman (hertzman@interchange.ubc.ca)

Version: 1 Date: 7 Nov 2001

Reviewer: Donald Cole

Level of interest: A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Advice on publication: Accept after revision, which I do not need to see

1. Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown: if not, what are the shortcomings and could they be overcome?

>> Yes.

2. Are sufficient details provided to allow replication of the work or comparison with related analyses: if not, what is missing?

>> Generally, yes. Some more detail on the ways the conditions scales were constructed out of the items would be helpful.

3. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition: if not, in what ways?

>> Generally, yes. Though I would make editorial changes.

4. Is the writing acceptable? (nb. Since we do not charge for access to published research, we cannot undertake the costs of editing poorly written papers. If you tell us that the writing is not acceptable for publication, we will ask the authors to find someone, or an editing service, to help them rewrite it. If you tell us that the paper is too poorly written for it to be peer reviewed, we will ask them to rewrite it now.)

>> Yes and needs to be edited for understanding and conciseness. Considerable redundancy between methods and results and between results and discussion. But important work on changes in working conditions and
occupational structure that should get out. Link to health less clear in this article - would be good to have self-reported health in there.

**Competing interests:**

Distant colleague of authors and work with IWH which fundd some of Alec Ostry (lead author's) time