Reviewer's report

Title: Filicide in Austria and Finland - A register-based study on all filicide cases in Austria and Finland 1995-2005

Version: 1  Date: 19 October 2009

Reviewer: Josephine Stanton

Reviewer's report:

Discretionary revisions

Question modest from a large high quality set of data bases. This is cited as a 'first' article, describing broad features.

To these broad goals methods are appropriate and well described. From description the data appear sound.

discussion and conclusions satisfactory balanced and supppoerted by the data

Limitations of work in looking at 2 European countries to explore if filicide can be looked at internationally is an important limitation they have named.

They acknowledge work they are building on

Title and abstract concise and convey what has been found.

Writing is acceptable.

This seems reasonable data to be made available to the scientific world. However, One would hope that more detailed analysis will be made of the data set. The data set is large which is good, but the questions and conclusions are very generally, eg looking at 'filicide' as a generic concept where there are a range of different sorts of filicide. Eg, they identify filicide with suicide. It would be of interest to get more detail fo these cases and the differences between these and neonaticide and more generic child battering with a fatal outcome.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests