Reviewer's report

Title: Quantitative EEG findings in depressed patients with rapidly changing psychiatric symptoms: A controlled study from an acute psychiatric department

Version: 1 Date: 13 July 2008

Reviewer: Pedro Ribeiro

Reviewer's report:

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined?
The main question is not well defined. The abstract and intro are very misleading. It is very hard to understand the main point of each paragraph.

2. Are the methods appropriate and well described?
The authors must mention average age and the deviation no the section population.
The authors must explain in more details spectral power, and describe the asymmetry equation’s.

3. Are the data sound?
The design is very confusing and poor. The main question is not well thought. I is not a compelling study.

4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition?
I don’t believe that the manuscript reach a relevant standard for reporting. Moreover, there is nothing extremely new on that kind of information.

5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data?
The authors had a very formal approach to deal with the discussion and sometimes support their argument with animal data or different techniques other than EEG.

6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated?
Not really.

7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished?
Yes.

8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found?
The authors should change the title. It is not clear what they want. In special,
they must think about the statement: “with rapidly changing psychiatric symptoms”.

9. Is the writing acceptable?
Needs some language corrections.

10. I didn’t see nothing that justify to publish this data on BMC Psychiatry.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
I declare that I have no competing interests.