Reviewer’s report

Title: Discontinuation of hypnotics in therapy of insomnia

Version: 2 Date: 23 May 2008

Reviewer: Toshiaki A Furukawa

Reviewer’s report:

Overall I find the manuscript presents interesting results, well written and have been revised in accordance with the previous reviewers’ comments.

If I may, I would like to add a few minor comments.

1) English needs to be polished up, to be suitable for a scientific and academic paper. For example, one would not write “”, anyway” (page 3) in an academic paper.

2) Are patients suffering from major depression excluded? The exclusion criteria listed on page 4 do not specify so.

3) I question the use of “hypnotic dependent” because, reading the descriptions, there is no indication that these patients are really “dependent.”

4) Have all the patients been successfully withdrawn from benzodiazepines? Or were there some failures?

5) Table 3 needs to show all the variables as in Tables 1 and 2.

6) CGI is usually scored between 1 and 6. How can the median be 10 or 8? (Tables 1 and 2)

7) Why does only one number follow the descriptor IQR? IQR stands for interquartile range, and therefore needs two numbers at 25% and 75% of the distribution.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have received research funds and speaking fees from Asahi Kasei, Astellas, Dai-Nippon Sumitomo, Eisai, Eli Lilly, GlaxoSmithKline, Janssen, Kyowa Hakko, Meiji, Nikken Kagaku, Organon, Otsuka, Pfizer, and Yoshitomi. He was on research advisory board for Pfizer, Janssen, Mochida and Meiji, and is currently
on research advisory board for Sekisui Chemicals. He has received royalties from Igaku-Shoin and Sewa-Shoten. The Japanese Ministry of Education, Science, and Technology and the Japanese Ministry of Health Labor and Welfare have also funded his research.