Reviewer's report

Title: Predicting violent infractions in a Swiss state penitentiary: a replication study of the PCL-R in a population of sex and violent offenders

Version: 1 Date: 17 June 2008

Reviewer: Wolfgang Berner

Reviewer's report:

The questions posed are well defined, The methods appropriate, the data sound, the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition. Perhaps one table showing the results would be helpful.

What is really missing in the conclusion and limitations is the discussion of the possible effect of different therapeutic methods offered to the offenders. This discussion should be added to the paper.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests