Reviewer’s report

Title: Dopamine transporter 3’UTR VNTR genotype is a marker of performance on executive function tasks in children with ADHD

Version: 1 Date: 6 December 2007

Reviewer: Stephen J Glatt

Reviewer’s report:

Based on their similarity in content, I concur with your initial judgment that these manuscripts might be suitable for combination into one paper. The two papers address a very common theme; i.e., the role of dopamine-inactivating genes in executive functions in ADHD. I would expect the authors to argue/counter that the two samples are different (40+ more subjects were genotyped on COMT than DAT) and different tests for executive functioning were used (the COMT paper describes Tower of London data, while the DAT study includes data from the Freedom from Distractibility Index [FFDI]), as well as the fact that one paper includes family-based data while the other does not. However, I would guess that all or most of the subjects in the DAT study were also genotyped on COMT, and that FFDI can be determined for the COMT-genotyped subjects (having already clearly completed the WISC); in addition, parental genotypes may be available for DAT. As a result of these actions, the authors (who could be listed as co-first authors) could tell a more comprehensive and integrative story which would be much more efficient and informative to busy readers; I also think the single manuscript would have more impact and a greater likelihood of acceptance, both of which should be important to the authors). There is ambiguity regarding the true combinability, but I think a serious inquiry and discussion with the corresponding author is warranted.