Reviewer’s report

Title: Psychological treatment of depression: A meta-analytic database of randomized studies

Version: 4 Date: 23 April 2008

Reviewer: Bruce E Wampold

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions-- None

Minor Essential Revisions:

The authors have addressed most of the issues raised in an earlier review. Because the major importance of this manuscript will be found in an online available data set, utmost care must be made to keep the online resource current and accurate. The authors appear to be prepared to do this.

The one issue to be addressed is the following, in re. to aggregating multiple dependent measures within studies. In this regard, the authors defer to CMA. However, CMA offers three alternatives for multiple measures: (a) mean of effect size, (b) first listed, and (c) aggregation based on independence. The choice used should be indicated and the method described. It should be noted that this reviewer does not find any of the alternatives satisfactory, as they do not account for the correlation among measures within studies. However, as long as the method is described in the on-line resource and in the article, this should suffice.

Discretionary Revisions--None.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.