Reviewer's report

Title: Psychiatric and psychosocial assessment of suicide attempters in Japan: a pilot study at a critical emergency unit in an urban city

Version: 3 Date: 7 August 2007

Reviewer: Johannes Lehtonen

Reviewer's report:

Yamada T et al. Psychiatric and psychosocial assessment of suicide attempters in Japan

The revised text has been changed rather little. Especially, information concerning the psychosocial variables related to suicide attempt is still practically lacking although the title addresses these issues. The authors should make it explicit if data was not collected. If the data is available, however, it should be given.

In the introduction the rates of the rise of suicide in Japan is given in an inaccurate way. The rate has risen from 25.2 to 27.0/100 000 since 98, which is not a large rise. Furthermore, the relevant period in years this rise took place is not given. On the other hand, the previous years’ rate was much lower 17-21/100 000, but the relevant time span is not precisely given. Please, specify.

The material was collected during 2,5 years from a catching area of 3.5 million people. Only 2967 patients entered the emergency center giving an appr. rate of 1200 patients annually (appr. 0.35 0/00 of the population). About 1/6 of these were suicide patients.

Please, specify the reason of the low rate of attendance to the emergency unit in order to give more credibility to the sample of suicide attempters. Furthermore, those dying before assessment are given as suicide attempters, whereas they were in fact suicide completers.

There are several grammatical errors and the language requires further revision.

I regard this report of scarce interest to international readers, but it carries relevance for national readers.