Reviewer's report

Title: Psychiatric Rating Scales In Urdu: A Systematic Review

Version: 1 Date: 6 September 2007

Reviewer: Saeed Farooq

Reviewer's report:

This is important paper and deserves publication. It addresses an important issue. Urdu is widely spoken language, not only in India and Pakistan but in many other countries and we need to be aware of the status of translated questionnaires in this language.

However, the draft would require many changes before it could be considered further.

The introduction needs to be changed, as it is too broad. There is no need to give the earthquake background. The author needs to highlight what is the importance of translation and validation in Urdu.

The methodology is adequate.

The results: There is no need for paragraph "Psychological and social questionnaires". This could be deleted.

The discussion needs much improvement. The authors have not put their work in context. For example, have there been similar systematic reviews of instruments in other languages? What is the status of translations in other languages and does how translation into Urdu compare with them? The actual findings of the review are not discussed properly. Although the criteria for the quality of translated instruments is mentioned in tables, the quality of studies is touched on neither in results nor in the discussion.