Reviewer's report

Title: Greater Incidence of Depression with Zolpidem, Zaleplon, Eszopiclone, and Ramelteon than with Placebo

Version: 5 Date: 22 May 2007
Reviewer: Michael T Smith

Reviewer's report:

General
None.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
None

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
None/

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

The author has been responsive to review. While there are limitations in the conclusions, they are now highlighted. This manuscript makes an important contribution that requires further study.

The new title, might be considered a bit misleading in that it singles out specific drugs, but no specific drug was statistically tested versus placebo... Rather, the author only made one statistical comparison between the rate of incident depression, amalgamated over all hypnotics versus placebo. Perhaps, the previous term, modern hypnotics, is more appropriate?

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

John Hopkins has received funding from Sepracor to conduct investigator (Smith, MT) initiated clinical trials.