Reviewer’s report

Title: Tridimensional Personality Questionnaire data on alcoholic violent offenders: specific connections to severe cluster B personality disorders and violent criminality

Version: 3 Date: 14 May 2007

Reviewer: Simone Ullrich

Reviewer’s report:

Reviewer’s Comments

Tridimensional Personality Questionnaire data on alcoholic violent offenders: specific connections to severe impulsive cluster B personality disorders and violent criminality
Tikkanen, R., Holi, M., Lindberg, N., Virkkunen, M.

Ad 1
The authors made it clear that participants of the control group underwent the same assessment procedure as the offenders and were excluded from the analyses if they fulfilled the criteria for a psychiatric disorder according to DSM-III-R. This information is very important and helpful in understanding the nature of the sample and results.

Ad 2
I agree with the authors that the majority of habitually violent offenders stem from lower socio-economic classes and show strong similarities with regard to other socio-demographic variables. However, unless it is not statistically proven that the results are independent of demography this issue remains on the level of assumption. The authors very briefly discuss this limitation in their conclusions.

The authors state that the results on TPQ differences between ASPD, Non-ASPD and healthy controls cannot be generalised to other populations due to the specific characteristics of the sample (alcoholic violent offenders with high PD – co-morbidity). This conclusion is correct. However, I still do not feel that the authors sufficiently address the problem of PD co-morbidity. Their aim is to demonstrate differences in individuals with and without diagnosis of Antisocial Personality Disorder. I am aware that my insistence on this point may seem somewhat obsessive. My own experience in research on personality disorders, though, and extensive discussion with colleagues on this issue has sensitised me for the problem of co-morbidity, and the confounding effects of other PDs should not be underestimated and may lead to different results.

Ad Minor Revisions
My requests for minor revisions were sufficiently addressed by the authors.