Reviewer's report

Title: The NRG1 exon 11 missense variant is not associated with autism in the Central Valley of Costa Rica

Version: 2 Date: 28 March 2007

Reviewer: Catalina Betancur

Reviewer's report:

The authors have answered appropriately the concerns raised in the review and the manuscript has been improved since its original submission, but there are a few minor remaining issues that still need to be addressed:

1) The authors forgot to make the correction suggested in point 2 of the previous review: Abstract, Results section: in the first sentence, the word “although” is used inappropriately. The sentence should read “The NRG1 exon 11 G>T variant was found in 4/146 cases, including one de novo occurrence” or something similar.

2) The Methods would be clearer with subheadings to separate the Subjects and Genotyping section.

3) In the subjects section: "Century" should be spelled with lower case 'c'. Also, there is an "and" that should be removed after PDD-NOS in the sentence "... Pervasive Developmental Disorder Not Otherwise Specified (PDD-NOS) and in a future whole genome association study of autism, ..."

4) Results: Remove the parenthesis at the end of the sentence: "487-2 ~1.04 Mb upstream from the first marker)."

5) Results: The sentence "None of the 12 ‘T’ carrier nontransmitting parents had a psychiatric disorder however AU025C, a 40 year old mother did have a sister with manic-depression and,..." would read better if separated in two sentences: "None of the 12 ‘T’ carrier nontransmitting parents had a psychiatric disorder. However, AU025C, a 40 year old mother did have a sister with manic-depression and,..."

6) Results: at the end of this section there are two successive sentences that start with "Finally"; only the last one should be left.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests