Reviewer's report

Title: Metabolic syndrome in Thai schizophrenic patients: a one-year follow-up study

Version: 3 Date: 28 February 2007

Reviewer: Jim van Os

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

This revised manuscript is significantly improved. However, the authors responded they are unable to evaluate the effect of medication on the development of the metabolic syndrome, since the current study is a naturalistic study.

As described in the first review, a large proportion of patients is switched from a first generation antipsychotic to a second generation, mostly sertindole, olanzapine and clozapine. These SGAs have a worse metabolic profile than the FGAs, which has probably influenced the rate of new-onset metabolic syndrome. This seriously limits the interpretation and generalizability of the incidence rate of metabolic syndrome the authors describe!

Publication of the current manuscript without at least describing this as an important limitation in the discussion section would, in my opinion, be inappropriate. Furthermore, I would recommend changing the title to: 'Metabolic syndrome in Thai schizophrenic patients: a naturalistic 1-year follow-up study'.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests