Reviewer's report

Title: The impact of the facial skeletal class on the psychological profile: an epidemiological survey on young Italian adults.

Version: 2 Date: 13 April 2006

Reviewer: Todd K. K Shackelford

Reviewer's report:

Review of “The impact of facial skeletal class on the psychological profile…,” submitted for publication in BMC-Psychiatry by Senna et al.

Major Compulsory Revisions (which the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The stated purpose of the research is to test the hypothesis that successful management of interpersonal relationships in young adults is related to facial skeletal class. What needs to be made explicit is the link between facial skeletal class and rated physical attractiveness. I suspect that if facial attractiveness is controlled, facial skeletal class may not longer be associated with judged interpersonal skills. Thus, it is not clear to me whether the authors are using facial skeletal class as a proxy for attractiveness or whether they are in fact interested in facial skeletal class per se. If the latter is the case, please provide the theoretical logic for why facial skeletal class might be linked to judged interpersonal skills.

Assuming the goal is to assess the link between facial skeletal class (and not attractiveness) and interpersonal skills, then the methodology is appropriate. The statistical analyses also are appropriate and sensibly interpreted. The discussion generally is balanced and appropriate, with sufficient details to allow for replication. The title might be clarified, substituting “expert-rated interpersonal skill” for “psychological profile.” The bottom line is that this research and this article will be clearer once the authors clarify their interesting facial skeletal class, as noted above. The writing is generally acceptable, but I respectfully recommend that the text be edited by a native English speaker.

I have no reason to believe that duplication has occurred. Ideally, ratings of facial attractiveness could be collected and statistically controlled, if the authors are interested in the relationship specifically of facial skeletal class and interpersonal skills.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'