Reviewer's report

Title: Insight dimensions and cognitive function in psychosis: A longitudinal study.

Version: 1 Date: 20 December 2005

Reviewer: Matcheri S Keshavan

Reviewer’s report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

This is an interesting study examining the relation between dimensions of insight and cognitive functions in a series of psychotic disorder patients. The strengths of the study include the robust statistical approach and inclusion of multiple assessment methods to measure insight. Some clarifications are needed, however.

1. It is not clear whether diagnoses were derived based on structured diagnostic interviews.
2. On page 9, it is stated that perseverative errors were part of the “non-perseverative” dimension. This needs clarification.
3. The sample size, as the authors admit, is not large (schizophrenia n was only 37). Type II errors are therefore quite possible. This possibility should be mentioned in the abstract.
4. Reference 45 (McEvoy 1993) does not seem to refer to the relation between cognition and insight.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No