Reviewer’s report

Title: Pretreatment Beck Depression Inventory score is an important predictor for Post-treatment Beck Depression Inventory score in infertile patients: a before after study

Version: 3 Date: 29 March 2005

Reviewer: Yumi Nakano

Reviewer’s report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1/4) Results page 7, line 19
The percentage of normal range in BDI2 score is smaller than that in BDI1 score simply because the number of patients in the non-pregnant group is much larger than that in the pregnant group. Therefore it is not important to compare the percentage of normal range in BDI2 to that in BDI1. It is more useful to observe the discrepancy between the percentage of normal range in BDI1 and that of normal range in BDI2 in each group (the non-pregnant group and the pregnant group).

1/4) Discussion page 10, line l7
You concluded “we assume that the factors which affect BDI2 in the pregnant group and those in the non-pregnant group are the same, because Table 4 shows no statistically significant difference among mean score of BDI1 in the two group.” Please explain in detail how the assumption was reached. Common sense tells us it is highly unlikely (see the following)

Suppose there are two patients whose BDI1 scores are the same. One is in the pregnant group and the other is in the non-pregnant group. Would you conclude that the factors which affect BDI2 in both patients are the same if their BDI2 scores are the same?

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

- Conclusion in Abstractâ€€”“---after treatment of infertility is week” should be ”weak”.
- page 8, line 1
"Multivariate” should be ”multiple”

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

I think that your point will become clearer and you can solve some problems I mentioned in Major Compulsory Revisions if you change the procedure of the paper as follows.
First, you examine the significant difference between BDI2 score in the pregnant group and that in the non-pregnant group. Then, you observe the factors which affect BDI2 in each group separately.
What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I can answer no to all of the questions