Reviewer's report

Title: Pretreatment Beck Depression Inventory score is an important predictor for Post-treatment Beck Depression Inventory score in infertile patients: a before after study

Version: 1 Date: 2 February 2005

Reviewer: Yumi Nakano

Reviewer's report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1 (the question posed by the author)
I think the explanation about the main question in this paper is not enough. What other factors do you suggest which may affect BDI2 score except for BDI1? You have to describe them if there is any.

TV4 (the methods) â€¢ OK
TV4 (the data) â€¢ OK
TV4 (adhere)
1) There are some parts where you don’t fully explain the relation between the analyzed data and the theme of this paper.

TV4 For example, I’d like to understand the reason why you show Table 2 and 3. What relation do those Tables have to the theme?
TV4 I assume that the factors which affect BDI2 in the pregnant group and those in the non-pregnant group are not the same, because Table 4 shows BDI1 > BDI2 in the pregnant group and BDI1 < BDI2 in the non-pregnant group. I’d like to know what you think about it.

TV4 (discussion)
TV4 p9.1.4 ~ 20 TV4. You have to show me how BDI1 and level of education, age, and duration of infertility relate to the theme and purpose of this paper.

TV4 (p10.1.19) The third risk factor - duration of infertility - isn’t included here. Please explain the reason.

6. title & abstract
The conclusion in the abstract doesn’t answer the main question of this paper, which is stated in the background section in the abstract and at the end of the main â€œintroductionâ€. Why not?

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

4. manuscript
p6.1.20 â€¢ I think the statistical analysis should be multiple regression analysis not logistic regression analysis, because the BDI2 score is a continuity variable.
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

**What next?:** Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests