Reviewer's report

Title: Suicide and No Axis I Psychopathology

Version: 1 Date: 8 January 2004

Reviewer: Paul S. Links

Reviewer's report:

This paper examines an important unstudied issue; whether subjects studied by psychological autopsy methods that show no Axis I disorders were more like normal controls or cases of suicide with Axis I psychopathology on measures of psychopathology. This study addressed a question that has not been empirically studied in other psychological autopsy studies. The psychological autopsy methods utilized were state-of-the-art and several established psychopathological measures were included in the analysis. The finding that these suicide victims were more similar to cases of suicide who were given an Axis I diagnosis adds significantly to our understanding of the relationship between psychopathology and suicide. The study has a limited sample size but this was anticipated. The paper is well written and the title and abstract are clear.

Discretionary Revisions: To understand the findings, the authors could have discussed whether excessive gambling is found in the group with Axis I disorders. In addition, the discussion should include some review of other research that has found a relationship between excessive gambling and suicide.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No