Reviewer's report

Title: The Use of S-Adenosylmethionine (SAM-e) for the Treatment of Depression in People Living with HIV/AIDS

Version: 4 Date: 19 October 2004

Reviewer: George Papakostas

Reviewer's report:

General

----------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. The authors must report response rates and remission rates for HAMD17 for completer and intent-to-treat analysis.
2. A reference for SCID-IV must be added.
3. Results section, second sentence as well as table 1: Adjust all variables to reflect n=20 not n=15.
4. Report the range in endpoint HAMD17 and BDI scores next to the standard deviation for completer and ITT (range: minimum, maximum)
5. Discussion section, 3rd paragraph, 2nd sentence "At week 8, mean depression scores indicate the absence of depression ..." : Clarify this is for completer analysis only since the endpoint mean HAMD17 for ITT is 7.7 and thus, some patients must have endpoint HAMD17 scores>7.
6. Discussion section, last paragraph, "More importantly, the therapeutic effect of SAMe ....BDI scores). Add an acknowledgement that placebo response is also rapid, and, thus, rapidity of onset from high placebo-response rates cannot be differentiated in open-label trials.
7. Add limitations to generalizeability to the limitations section (as a function of exclusion criteria).

----------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

----------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No