Reviewer's report

Title: The Use of S-Adenosylmethionine (SAM-e) for the Treatment of Depression in People Living with HIV/AIDS

Version: 3 Date: 27 September 2004

Reviewer: Arlene Kochman

Reviewer's report:

General

---------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached) The author makes generalized statements regarding "depression in this population is largely untreated"-should give citations to back this up and should refer to work done example: Heckman et al on depression/suicidal ideation for HIV men and women 50+. "Stigma remains large"-should give citations. "Primary care physicians are often unprepared and so on"-entire paragraph needs citations. More reading in this area and citations would make this paper more academically credible.

There should be a section headed "Study limitations. There is no control group. There may be the halo effect of just seeing a clinician and getting attention and the "n"is very small..

---------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

The author states that of the participants the majority were people of color-what % or # were people of color to be consistent.

---------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

None

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests: None