Reviewer's report

Title: The Use of S-Adenosylmethionine (SAM-e) for the Treatment of Depression in People Living with HIV/AIDS

Version: 3 Date: 8 September 2004

Reviewer: George Papakostas

Reviewer's report:

General
An interesting report. However, much is missing from the methodology.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. An outline of inclusion/ exclusion criteria in the methods
2. A description of how a depressive disorder was established for inclusion in the study (ie SCID? MINI?)
3. Authors must also report an intent-to-treat analysis for endpoint (week 8)
4. Authors must report all numbers with accompanying standard deviation.
5. Reasons for discontinuation must be stated in the results.
6. There is no limitations section (i.e. lack of placebo comparator, etc). the paper would need a limitations section.
7. The authors need to clarify the phrase"at week 8, all patients scored below the minimum score for depression on both the BDI and HAMD( discussion section). This is not supported in the results section, asno range for endpoint HAMD or BDI is offered.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
None at this time

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
None at this time

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

No